

UNESCO CHAIR/UNITWIN NETWORK PROGRESS REPORT FORM

Title of the Chair/Network:	UNESCO Chair in Cultural Property Protection & Peace
Host Institution:	Newcastle University, UK
Date of establishment of Chair/Network: <i>(mm, yyyy)</i>	June 2016
Period of activity under report: <i>(mm, yyyy - mm, yyyy)</i>	1 January 2017 – 31 December 2017 (even though the agreement for the Chair was only finally signed in June 2016 the University started to pay me to carry out these duties from 1/1/16)
Report established by: <i>(name, position)</i>	Professor Peter Stone, UNESCO Chair-holder

1. Executive Summary:

Major outcomes, results and impact of the Chair, including on national policies, in relation to its objectives as stated in Article 2 of the Chair Agreement (between the Institution and UNESCO)
(Not exceeding 300 words)

The purpose of the Chair is to:

- Better understand cultural property protection (CPP) and the illicit antiquities trade through research & publication;
- Raise awareness/ensure knowledge transfer of the value of CPP within the heritage sector, the military, educational groups and the general public by developing free, online training materials, delivering seminars and lectures, and producing appropriate publications;
- Establish an effective Blue Shield;
- Co-operate closely with UNESCO.

SUMMARY OF ACTIVITY:

Development of understanding/raising awareness of CPP:

- a) Supporting the passing of the Cultural Protection (Armed Conflicts) Act to enable the UK to ratify the 1954 Hague Convention and its two Protocols all of which came into Law in the UK on 12 December 2017;
- b) Receiving additional financial support from my University to appoint 1.5 staff to support my UNESCO Chair;
- c) Developing relations with the US Air force and NATO to integrate better CPP training and practice in their activities;
- d) The UNESCO Chair team training various elements of the UK Armed Forces and leading the CPP workshop of the European military 'Coping with Culture' conference;
- e) Working as a member of the Joint Service CPP Working Group to ensure that UK Armed Forces comply fully with the 1954 Hague Convention;
- f) Leading on the drafting of the 'Blue Shield Approach' – the underlying document for the

- activity of the Blue Shield;
- g) Supporting the United Nations Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights with her work to make access to cultural heritage a universal human right and presenting at a seminar organized by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in Geneva;
 - h) Being appointed to the Advisory Group for the British Council and Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport regarding the UK's Cultural Protection Fund (CPF);
 - i) Speaking at 9 international (including 3 military) and 4 national academic/ professional conferences;
 - j) Speaking to one general public and 3 student audiences;
 - k) Publishing two academic and two general publications (see below).

Establishment of an effective international Blue Shield:

- a) Organising, with Austrian colleagues, the 2017 Blue Shield General Assembly in Vienna in September 2017
- b) "The Blue Shield Approach" was forwarded by the General Assembly to the new Blue Shield Board for implementation;
- c) Maintaining regular Skype meetings of the International Bureau and Board.

Cooperation with UNESCO:

My primary links with UNESCO have been:

- a) Support for the creation of a Blue Shield Pacifica;
- b) Attendance at the Hague Convention Intergovernmental Committee for the 2nd Protocol as the Blue Shield representative.

2) Activities:

Overview of activities undertaken by the Chair during the reporting period

a) Education/Training/Research

(key education programmes and training delivered and research undertaken by the Chair during the reporting period, target group and geographical coverage)

<p>i) Education (leading to certificate)</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>ii) Training (short term)</p>	<p>Military training courses delivered in 2017 by UK Blue Shield (led by Dr Paul Fox)</p> <p>(21-23 Feb) Deliver CPP course to UK Defence Cultural Specialist Unit</p> <p>(4 Mar) Blue Shield presentation to 77 Brigade staff</p> <p>(19 May) Blue Shield presentation to 77 Brigade Civil Affairs Course</p> <p>(12 Sept) Blue Shield presentation to 77 Brigade Civil Affairs Course</p>

<p>iii) Research</p>	<p>[1] Alongside the work outlined below Professor Stone has been carrying out research regarding the seven risks to cultural property in the event of armed conflict and possible means to mitigate the impact of these risks. These were first identified in his 2016 <i>Museum International</i> article “The Challenge of Protecting Heritage in Times of Armed Conflict” and he is planning to develop them in an article in 2018 in the <i>British Army Review</i>.</p> <p>[2] Professor Stone was also part of the Hilali Network, a research project linking digital technology to the preservation of oral history for Bedouin groups in Egypt funded by the Newton-Mosharafa Fund. During his visit to Egypt he met with representatives from a consortium of Egyptian universities and this has resulted in an Erasmus plus application to develop M Level programmes in heritage management in Egyptian universities including modules on CPP. Outcome expected autumn 2018.</p>
<p>iv) Other</p>	<p>1.0 THE DEVELOPMENT OF UNDERSTANDING AND RAISING OF AWARENESS OF CPP</p> <p>a) Supporting internal legislation to enable the UK to ratify the 1954 Hague Convention and its two Protocols. Despite having signed the 1954 Hague Convention in 1954, the UK had failed to take the necessary steps to ratify the Convention or its Protocols. Since 2003, through various channels, the Chair-holder had discussed ratification with successive governments only to be told that the government was committed to ratification ‘as soon as Parliamentary time could be found’. The UK Government finally announced its intention to ratify the Convention and both Protocols in the May 2016 Queen’s Speech. The Cultural Property (Armed Conflict) Bill received Royal Assent in February 2017. During its progress through Parliament the Chair-holder worked with Members of both Houses of Parliament, Ministers, and civil servants to smooth and speed the passing of the Bill. This was made doubly difficult by the Brexit decision that required a new set of Ministers to be briefed. The Chair-holder was thanked publically as the UNESCO Chair by Peers and MPs during debates and referred to in a meeting with civil servants as the “mother of the Bill” by the responsible Minister in the Lords.</p> <p>b) Advising the British Council and Department for Culture Media and Sport regarding the UK’s Cultural Protection Fund (CPF). While it is no doubt funding excellent individual projects, the UK’s CPF has not produced the strategic impetus for CPP that had been hoped for by the CPP community or argued for by the Chair while advising the British Council. Professor Stone has recently been appointed to the CPF’s Advisory Group and hopes from this position to influence the strategic vision and legacy potential of the CPF in the future.</p> <p>c) Working as a member of the Joint Service Cultural Property Protection Working Group (CPPWG) to ensure that UK Armed Forces comply fully with the Hague Convention. This Working Group</p>

was set up following its Chairman reading Professor Stone's 2013 '4 Tier Approach' article. It is expected a specialised CPP unit will be fully operational in UK forces by 2020. This is a really significant development and, it is hoped, can be used as an exemplar for other countries through an enhanced Blue Shield network (see [2] below). There is still a significant amount of work to do here regarding the practical and technical aspects of CP to be protected in the event of armed conflict and the training and expertise of the Unit's staff. Professor Stone's role on this WG is now mainly being covered by Dr Paul Fox.

- d) Speaking at 9 international and 4 national academic/professional conferences (in 2017).** Listed below.
- e) Speaking to one general public and 3 student audiences (in 2017)** Listed below.
- f) Publishing 2 peer reviewed academic and 2 general publications.** Listed below.

2.0 WORKING TO ESTABLISH AN EFFECTIVE INTERNATIONAL BLUE SHIELD

- a) The Blue Shield Approach.** One of the key aims of the UNESCO Chair in Cultural Property Protection and Peace is the establishment of an effective Blue Shield organisation – the international NGO created in 1999 as the advisory body to UNESCO regarding the protection of cultural property during armed conflict. The Blue Shield has never had core funding and has struggled to fulfil its obligations, with different national committees formulating very different approaches to this work.

Building on progress prior to the establishment of the UNESCO Chair Professor Stone has led the development of 'The Blue Shield Approach' – a document that sets out the overall context and framework of the activities of the Blue Shield. The Approach is not intended to make all national committees follow exactly the same agenda but rather work within the same parameters towards a common goal – the protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict and following environmental disaster. The Approach was debated during the 2017 Blue Shield General Assembly and passed by that Assembly to the international Board for action in 2018.

- b) Appointment by Newcastle University of 1.5 staff to support the work of the UNESCO Chair.** Two members of staff have been appointed to support Stone's Chair. Dr (ex Lt Col) Paul Fox (appointed July 2017) will work primarily with armed forces to develop training and full implementation of the convention and Dr Emma Cunliffe (appointed December 2017) will work with armed forces on geo-spatial activities while providing the primary support for the Blue Shield network (web-site etc.)

b) Conferences/Meetings

(key conferences and meetings organized by the Chair or to which its Chair-holder contributed)

i) Key conferences and workshops hosted by the Chair

N/A

ii) Other conferences/organizational activities undertaken by the Chair-holder

- a) Stone and Fox organised a CPP day at the UK Defence Academy's '**Culture in Conflict**' conference. The full programme is attached as Appendix 1.
- b) Stone organised, with Austrian colleagues, the **Blue Shield, General Assembly** in Vienna. The full programme is attached as Appendix 2.
- c) Stone presented a key-note Briefing on CPP-activities and Fox led the workshop on CPP at the '**Coping with Culture**' conference, Koblenz, Germany. Paul Fox's report attached as Appendix 3.

iii) A selection of conference presentations by the Chair-holder

Academic/Professional engagements in 2017

- 1) (January) **Invited discussant**, Defence Geospatial Intelligence Conference, Panel Discussion – Collaboration on Cultural Property Protection – Challenges & Opportunities
- 2) (February) **Invited speaker**, Blue-Helmet-Blue-Shield-Forum Austria: Best Practice on Peace Keeping and Cultural Property Protection. *The Blue Shield and cultural property protection*
- 3) (March) **Invited discussant**, New York Times Art for Tomorrow conference, Qatar: Boundaries, Identity and the Public Realm. Session: The past for the future: protection of cultural legacy: Palmyra.
- 4) (March) **Invited speaker**, US Air Force Language, Regional Expertise, and Culture Symposium, Maxwell Air Force Base, *The development and future applications of the UN course on cultural property protection for armed forces*
- 5) (March) **Invited Keynote speaker**, US Air Force Language, Regional Expertise, and Culture Symposium, Maxwell Air Force Base, *The protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict; unhelpful distraction or important responsibility?*
- 6) (April) **Invited speaker**, Chartered Institute of Archaeologists Annual conference, *Protecting cultural property during armed conflict: an international perspective*
- 7) (May) **Invited speaker**, Lincoln University Seminar, *The protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict*
- 8) (June) **Invited Keynote speaker**, Protection of Cultural Heritage in Emergency Situations' Ankara, Turkey, *Protecting Cultural Property in Conflict: Critical responsibility or unnecessary distraction?*
- 9) (July) **Invited speaker**, Seminar on "Cultural rights and the protection of cultural heritage" UN Geneva, *The work of the Blue Shield*
- 10) (October) **Invited speaker**, Communicating World Heritage, Ironbridge, UK, World Heritage sites as ambassadors for peace
- 11) (October) **Invited speaker**, National Cultural Heritage Strategy conference, Peru *The protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict*
- 12) (November) **Invited speaker**, Hilali Network Seminar, (Newton-Mosharafa Fund) Egypt, *Ghosts from the past. The value of tangible and intangible cultural heritage to the present and future*
- 13) (November) **Invited speaker**, Institut français d'archéologie orientale Egypt, *Protecting Cultural Heritage in Conflict and Wars - Lessons Learned*

General speaking engagements

- 14) (January) **Invited speaker**, Hexham Debates, *Protecting cultural heritage during armed conflict: an impossible aspiration?*
- 15) (March) **York students**, *Cultural property in conflict and peace*
- 16) (June) Invited speaker, **Sotheby's Art Crime Summer School**, London, *The protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict or environmental disaster*
- 17) **Invited speaker** NZ students, (by Skype), *Cultural property in conflict and peace*

c) Interuniversity Exchanges/Partnerships

(principal exchanges/partnerships between the Chair and other institutions including UNESCO Chairs/UNITWIN Networks)

N/A

d) Publications/Multimedia Materials

(major publications and teaching/learning materials)

Please tick relevant fields of output and indicate volume of output:

Books

Books (edited)

Books (chapters)

Monographs

Research Reports

Journal Articles (refereed)

X

2

Conference Proceedings

Occasional Papers

Teaching/Learning Materials

Multimedia Materials (CD-Rom)

f) Other*(any other activities to report)*

N/A

3. Future Plans and Development Prospects:

Outline of action plan for the next biennium and short/medium and long-term development prospects. Please do not hesitate to refer to difficulties that the Chair has experienced (Not exceeding 300 words)

The Chair's primary objective for January-December 2017 was to build an effective UNESCO team at Newcastle. This has been substantially achieved by the appointment of Fox and Cunliffe.

For 2018 the team's objectives are to:

- Work with the UK Government regarding the UK's implementation of the 1954 Hague Convention & Protocols;
- Continue the development of The Blue Shield as an efficient organisation;
- Help develop UK Armed Forces doctrine and capability concerning Cultural Property Protection (with CPPWG);
- Continue to develop training materials and curricula for Cultural Property Protection;
- Help develop better geospatial understanding between the military and heritage communities;
- Continue to liaise with NATO and national armed forces over the development of NATO CPP doctrine and training materials;
- Continue to liaise with USAF over integration of CPP into training;
- Continue to support the development of a Blue Shield Pasifica committee;
- Research and write peer-reviewed article on the seven risks to cultural property for British Army Review;
- Research peer-reviewed article on the ethics of cultural heritage experts working with the military;
- Continue search for long-term funding for a University Centre for Cultural Property Protection and Peace.

Appendix:**1) Human Resources**

Chair-holder: Professor Peter Stone OBE

Professor Stone is Professor of Heritage Studies, and was formally Head of School of Arts and Cultures, at Newcastle University, UK.

Associated staff: Dr Paul Fox (0.5)
Dr Emma Cunliffe (Full time)

The School of Arts and Cultures is part of the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, one of three Faculties that make-up the University. The Chair is line-managed by the University's Deputy Vice Chancellor, who also carries out the Chair's annual Professional Development Review. The Chair has line-management responsibility for the 1.5 staff appointed to support his work.

2) Financial Resources

<i>Please tick sources of financial contribution and specify the amount in U.S. dollars</i>	Amount (\$)
Host Institution	Chair salary: c. \$124,000 Travel & support: \$ 15,000 Other salaries: c. \$ 56,000 Other T&S: c. \$ 6,000

Give details of financial contributions, material resources and space.

The UNESCO Chair is fully funded by Newcastle University which has also allocated \$15,000 per annum for travel and other support for the Chair.

The Chair is provided with an office as appropriate for an academic at Professorial level at Newcastle University. Cunliffe has the same office space as normal for a research associate; Fox is a home-worker. All staff have all usual support, including administrative support from within the School of Arts and Cultures, access to a union, pension scheme, Human Resources, IT, and Health & Safety advice and support etc.

APPENDIX 1

UK Defence Academy: Culture in Conflict conference: CPP Day 28 June 2017

08.50	09.00		Introduction: Professor Peter Stone OBE, UNESCO Chair in Cultural Property Protection and Peace, Newcastle University
09.00	09.30	[1]	Keynote: Ratification and compliance with the 1954 Hague Convention and its Protocols Karl Jagdis, Head of Implementation - Cultural Property (Armed Conflicts) Act, Department of Culture, Media and Sport
09.30	10.00	[2]	The new UK Joint Service Cultural Property Protection Capability Lt Col Tim Purbrick RL, SO1 Concepts Media, Information Warfare & Cyber Warfare, Army Headquarters
10.00	10.30	[3]	The Blue Shield Approach Professor Peter Stone OBE, UNESCO Chair in Cultural Property Protection and Peace, Newcastle University
10.30	11.00		Tea / Coffee
11.00	11.30	[4]	Education and training for decision making Nigel Jones, Accordance Associates
11.30	12.00	[5]	Cultural Heritage Assessment and Advisory Detachment (Airborne) Major Michael A. Delacruz (TBC), Assistant G5, 1st Special Forces Command (Airborne)
12.00	12.30		Plenary Discussion
12.30	13.30		LUNCH
13.30	14.00	[6]	The Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East & North Africa Project – collecting heritage information – Dr Robert Bewley, The EAMENA Project, Oxford University,
14.00	14.30	[7]	Legal imperatives and moral obligations Dr Emma Cunliffe EAMENA Project, Durham University,
14.30	15.00	[8]	What does CPP intelligence look like? Dr Paul Fox, UK national committee of the Blue Shield,
15.00	15.30		Plenary Discussion
15.30	16.00		Tea / Coffee
16.00	16.30	[9]	CPP in NATO-led operations: A way forward institutionalising CPP in a political-military organisation Sera Orzel Gaeta, Branch Head A5 Civil Military Interaction (CMI) & Acting Civilian Advisor, OPI Directorate - J9 Division, Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers Europe,
16.30	17.00		Plenary Discussion

APPENDIX 2

BLUE SHIELD GENERAL ASSEMBLY

Wiener Rathaus, Felderstrasse 1

DAILY PROGRAMME

Tues 12 September

Delegates arrive

16.00-18.00 Meeting of Interim Board - *Rathaus (Town Hall)*

19.00-21.00 President's welcome reception

Melker Stiftskeller

Schottengasse 3, 1010 Vienna

<http://www.melkerstiftskeller.at/>

Wed 13 September

08.30-09.30 Registration & coffee

09.30-10.30 Opening Ceremony

09.30-09.40 Welcome to Vienna by the President of the Austrian National Committee of the Blue Shield - *Ursula Stenzel*

09.40-09.50 Welcome to the General Assembly by the Interim President of the Blue Shield - *Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen*

09.50-10.00 Statement by ICA - *Emilie Gagnet Leumas*

10.00-10.10 Statement by ICOM - *Peter Keller*

10.10-10.20 Statement by ICOMOS - *Bijan Rouhani*

10.20-10.30 Statement by IFLA - *Gerald Leitner*

10.30-12.00 GA Session 1: The future role of Blue Shield - 1

Chair - *Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen*, Interim President of the Blue Shield

10.30-11.00 The Interim Board Report, Blue Shield Approach and suggested roles and responsibilities for the Board and national committees - *Peter Stone*

11.00-11.30 General discussion and Q&A of Blue Shield Approach and roles and responsibilities

11.30-12.00 Generic issues from national committee reports & Milan meeting - *Robyn Riddett & Angela Dellebeke*

12.00-13.00 LUNCH

13.00-16.30 GA Session 2: The future role of Blue Shield - 2

13.00-15.00 Group discussion of Interim Board Report, Blue Shield Approach, follow-up from Milan, & national committee issues

15.00-15.30 TEA & COFFEE

15.30-16.00 Group feedback

Chair - *Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen*, Interim President of the Blue Shield

16.00-16.30 Final discussion of Interim Board Report, Blue Shield Approach, follow-up from Milan, & national committee issues

16.30-17.00 Networking break

17.00-19.00 Public Plenary Session: Facing the challenges for the protection of our common cultural heritage

Chair - Friedrich Schipper, Austrian Blue Shield

17.00-17.05 Chair's introduction

17.05-17.20 President's Awards

17.20-17.45 *Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen*, Interim President of the Blue Shield

17.45-18.10 *Irina Bokova, DG UNESCO*
18.10-18.35 *Agnes Husslein-Arco, Director Leopold Museum*
18.35-19.00 Panel Q&A session
19.00-22.00 Reception hosted by the Mayor of Vienna

Thurs 14

08.30-09.30 Registration & coffee
09.30-10.30 GA Session 3: Reports
Chair – Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen
09.30-09.50 Treasurer’s Report - *Axel Mykleby*
09.50-10.10 New Blue Shield website - *Joanne Farchakh Bajjaly*
10.10-10.30 Recommendations from the Interim Board - *Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen*
10.30-12.00 Elections
Chair - Ursula Stenzel, President of the Austrian National Committee of the Blue Shield
Election information and process - *Ursula Stenzel*
Statements by those standing for the Board including Q&A
Voting by secret ballot
Statement by the candidate standing for the post of President
Voting by show of hands
Announcement of election results
12.00-13.00 LUNCH
13.00-15.00 GA Session 4: Training for CPP in armed conflict and environmental disaster
Chair - Nancy Wilkie, President, U.S. Committee of the Blue Shield
13.00-13.25 The Blue Shield education and training package - *Paul Fox*
13.25-13.50 *Training for natural disaster - UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA)*
13.50-14.15 *ICCRROM First Aid course - Aparna Tandon*
14.15-14.40 The Smithsonian’s Cultural Rescue Initiative - *Cori Wegener*
14.40-15.00 General discussion
15.00-15.30 TEA & COFFEE
15.30-17.30 GA Session 5 – CIMIC Expert Seminar:
Civil/Military cooperation regarding the protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflict and natural disaster
Chair: Austrian Armed Forces
15.30-15.55 From Awareness to Decision-Making to Action: US Air Force Initiatives to Protect Cultural Property - *Matt McKinney, Scott Edmondson*
15.55-16.20 Cultural Property Protection (CPP) in NATO-led operations: A way forward institutionalising CPP in a political-military organisation - *James Hancock*
16.20-16.45 CIMIC and human security in humanitarian assistance at the Kofi Annan International Peacekeeping Training Centre, Ghana
16.45-17.10 NATO affiliated CIMIC Centre of Excellence, The Hague - *Wouter van Koeveringe*
17.10-17.30 General discussion
17.30-18.00 Networking break
18.00-19.30 Optional - Showing of *Destruction of Memory*

Fri 15 September

08.30-09.00 Registration & coffee
09.00-12.00 GA Session 6: Protecting the cultural heritage of the Middle East and Africa
Chair TBC

09.00-09.25	Syria - <i>Maamoun Abdulkarim</i>
09.25-09.50	Libya - <i>Hafed Walda</i>
09.50-10.15	Yemen - <i>Michael Fradley, EAMENA Project</i>
10.15-10.40	Mali - <i>Kèba Sangaré</i>
10.40-11.05	Iraq - <i>TBC</i>
11.05-11.30	The Blue Shield Approach from an African perspective - <i>Bayo Folorunso</i>
11.30-12.00	General discussion
12.00-13.00	LUNCH
13.00-13.50	Guided tour of the Town Hall
14.00-16.00	GA Session 7: Organisational disaster risk reduction: The work of the Founding Four organisations Chair - <i>Leylya Strobl</i> , Austrian national committee of the Blue Shield/Austrian Roerich Society
14.00-14.25	ICA speaker - <i>Emilie Gagnet Leumas</i>
14.25-14.50	ICOM speaker - <i>Peter Keller</i>
14.50-15.15	ICOMOS speaker - <i>Luigi Petti</i>
15.15-15.40	IFLA speaker - <i>Genevieve Clavel</i>
15.40-16.00	General discussion
16.00-16.30	TEA & COFFEE
16.30-17.30	GA Session 8: From the Roerich Pact to the Hague Convention: perspectives of international co-operation
16.30-16.45	From the Roerich Pact to the Hague Convention: two legal traditions, one common goal - <i>Friedrich Schipper</i>
16.45-17.30	The legacy of Nicholas Roerich and the work of the international network of the Roerich Societies - <i>Leylya Strobl</i> , with <i>Aleksandr Stetsenko</i> (in eventu <i>Marga Kutzarova</i> , Bulgarian Roerich Society) and <i>Liliya Monasipova</i> (Uzbek Roerich Society)
17.30-17.45	BREAK
17.45-18.15	Closing ceremony The future of the Blue Shield - <i>President of the Blue Shield</i>

APPENDIX 3

Coping with Culture 2017, Workshop 4: cultural property protection (CPP) as a factor in strategic communications (Paul Fox Report)

The workshop addressed four questions:

- What sort of cultural property (CP) intelligence is required to achieve information dominance?
- How can the heritage community support military CPP activity, including information operations?
- Is it possible to anticipate generic adversary messaging opportunities?
- How can we prepare to pre-empt, dislocate, and disrupt adversary CPP messaging?

Thematics

CPP Doctrine. The workshop noted the general absence of military CPP doctrine; it will remain difficult to fold CPP into operational activity, including information operations, until doctrine exists. In the interim, it was important to recognise that, while heritage practitioners are the experts on maintaining and sustaining peacetime CPP, in the event of armed conflict, and during the early stages of disaster relief operations, the armed forces of nation states typically provide CPP first response. In such circumstances, armed forces are the end user of CPP intelligence, much of which will be provided by subject matter experts in the heritage community. That being the case, it is fundamentally important that armed forces define in peacetime what CP intelligence they require in order to undertake military CPP, and to justify their actions in the court of international public opinion.

Requirement 1: Intelligence. The workshop debated the nature of CP intelligence, which was perceived as fundamental to the CPP mission: it is impossible to make mission-focussed decisions in the absence of CPP understanding. It was agreed that any debate about cultural property/ heritage, is fundamentally about people - not objects. In particular, in the context of information operations, it is necessary to understand how value is estimated by multiple target audiences, including:

- The local population
- Adversaries
- Allies/partners
- Domestic audiences
- Unspecified, and potentially invisible/unrecognised others

Requirement 2: Military CPP First Aid. In addition to detailed CPP intelligence, armed forces on operations must be trained to deliver military CPP first aid. This will include personnel trained to conduct an initial, non-specialist, survey of CP in the area in which they are operating, in order to scope the CPP challenge, enrich the CP intelligence database, and inform the planning of subsequent heritage CPP first aid. The workshop noted that it is important to recognise that military and heritage first aid activities are complementary, and may be sequenced; the aim should be to begin developing CPP intelligence and first aid responses from the earliest possible moment, which also has the advantage of providing the understanding necessary to factor CPP into information operations campaign development. It follows that CPP planning, including the option to conduct an early CPP reconnaissance, should be considered from the very beginning of operational planning, or crisis response.

Information operations expertise. Information operations and PSYOPS workshop experts upheld the desirability of embedding CPP in the contest for information dominance, not least because target audiences will likely engage with CPP messaging, given that CP/heritage is a deeply personal issue associated with identity formation and attitudes to others. They recommended that CPP should feature as a factor in the construction of strategic narratives; that CPP messaging should be synchronous; and that themes should be deployed repeatedly. They stressed the need for target audience analysis and strongly endorsed the view that intelligence-led CPP planning is fundamental to achieving this aim.

Conclusions

- Nation states should be urged to produce and share their lists (databases) of significant CP in order to enable operational military planning.
- Military and heritage practitioners should be trained to understand their combined roles and responsibilities in order to develop collaborative team working, not least in the early production of CP intelligence, and the delivery of CPP first aid. Military and heritage CPP practitioners should participate in collective training in order to develop mutual understanding, and to develop CPP tactical doctrine, techniques, and procedures.
- CPP should feature from the outset as a distinct theme during the planning and execution of information operations.

End of the Form